File No. 2017 01H 0029

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF NEWFONDLAND AND LABRADOR COURT OF APPEAL

IN THE MATTER OF Section 13 of Part I of the *Judicature Act*, R.S.N.L. 1990, c. J-4

AND

IN THE MATTER OF Section 32 of the *Pension Benefits Act*, 1997, S.N.L. 1996, c. P-4.01

AND

IN THE MATTER OF a Reference of The Lieutenant-Governor in Council to the Court of Appeal for its hearing, consideration and opinion on the interpretation of the scope of s. 32 of the *Pension Benefits Act*, 1997

FACTUM OF MORNEAU SHEPELL IN ITS CAPACITY AS REPLACEMENT PENSION PLAN ADMINISTRATOR

Ronald A. Pink, Q.C.
Bettina Quistgaard
Pink Larkin
1763 South Park Street
Suite 201
Halifax, NS B3J 2L1
T. 902.423.7777
F. 902.423.9588

Counsel for Morneau Shepell

I. Overview

- 1. This reference raises two important issues of statutory interpretation:
 - (1) Do the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established in s. 32 of the Newfoundland and Labrador *Pension Benefits Act*, 1997, SNL 1996, c. P-4.01 ("PBA") include the termination payment required under s. 61(2)?
 - (2) Do the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established in s. 32 of the *PBA* (in the absence of an agreement entered into under the *PBA* to such effect) apply to pension plan members who are or were employed in another jurisdiction in this case, in Quebec or on works declared by an act of Parliament to be for the general advantage of Canada?
- 2. The first issue is of fundamental importance to members and beneficiaries of pension plans that are governed by the PBA. The Legislature has established these deemed trusts and the lien and charge to protect and preserve the funding requirements in the PBA. A central purpose of the PBA is to ensure that pension plans are appropriately funded and that the pension promise is met.
- 3. The importance of the funding requirements, and the protection of these requirements established in s. 32, is underscored in the circumstances giving rise to this reference namely, the termination of two underfunded pension plans as a result of the insolvency of the employer.
- 4. The circumstances giving rise to the reference are set out in the Statement of Facts. Morneau Shepell understands that the role of the Statement of Facts is to explain how the reference questions arose, and to provide the Court with some understanding of when sections 32 and 61(2) of the *PBA* may be engaged and how pension entitlements may be affected by their interpretation and scope.
- 5. With respect to the first issue, Morneau Shepell agrees with and adopts the submissions of the Newfoundland and Labrador Superintendent of Pensions. Specifically, Morneau Shepell

agrees that the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established under ss. 32(2) extend to the termination payments under ss. 61(2) of the *PBA*.

- 6. With respect to the second issue, Morneau Shepell agrees with and adopts the submissions of the Superintendent of Pensions, the Attorney General of Canada and OSFI, and Retraite Québec (the "regulators"). Specifically, Morneau Shepell agrees that, as a matter of statutory interpretation and the intention of the Legislature, the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established in s. 32 of the *PBA* apply only to employment within the legislative jurisdiction of the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador.
- 7. In addition to the submissions of the regulators, Morneau Shepell wishes to add or underscore the points and comments set out below, and to highlight the provisions of the *PBA* that are relevant to the issues of statutory interpretation on this reference.

II: The PBA

8. The following provisions of the *PBA* are relevant to the first issue raised by the reference, namely the scope of s. 32:

Definitions

2. In this Act

(bb) "pension fund", in relation to a pension plan, means a fund maintained to provide pension benefits under the plan;

(cc) "pension plan" means a superannuation or other plan organized and administered to provide pension benefits to employees and to which the employer is required, in accordance with the plan, to contribute; ...

Administrators of pension plans

- 12. (1) Except in the case of a multi-employer pension plan, the administrator of a plan shall be
 - (a) the employer; ...

Duties of administrator

- 14. (1) An administrator shall administer a pension plan and pension fund as a trustee for the employer, the members and former members of the plan, and other persons with an entitlement under the plan.
 - (2) An administrator of a pension plan is responsible for administering the plan and the pension fund and for filing the required documents in accordance with this Act.

Eligibility for registration

- 19. (1) A pension plan is not eligible for registration unless
 - (a) It provides for the accrual of pension benefits in a gradual and uniform manner; and
 - (b) The formula for computation of the employer's contributions to the pension fund or the pension benefit provided under the plan is not variable at the discretion of the employer.

Contents of pension plan documents

22. (1) The documents that create and support a pension plan shall set out

(f) the contributions or the method of calculating the contributions required;

(m) a provision for funding of pension benefits provided under the plan which sets out the obligation of the employer, or any person required to make contributions on behalf of an employer, to contribute both in respect of the normal cost of those benefits and any going concern unfunded liabilities and solvency deficiencies under the plan;

Remittance

. . .

30. (1) An employer shall, within the period prescribed by the regulations, remit employer and member contributions due under a pension plan, and other payments required under this Act, ...

(2) Where an employer fails to remit contributions in accordance with subsection (1), subsequent payment of contributions shall include interest on the contributions as prescribed by the regulations.

Failure to remit

31. Where an employer or trustee fails to remit contributions required under section 30 within 30 days after the end of the period prescribed by the regulations, the administrator of the plan or, where the employer or trustee is the administrator of the plan, the fundholder, who should have received them shall immediately notify the superintendent in writing of the failure.

Amounts to be held in trust

- 32 (1) An employer or a participating employer in a multi-employer plan shall ensure, with respect to a pension plan, that
 - (a) the money in the pension fund;
 - (b) an amount equal to the aggregate of
 - (i) the normal actuarial cost, and
 - (ii) any special payments prescribed by the regulations, that have accrued to date; and

(c) all

- (i) amounts deducted by the employer from the member's remuneration, and
- (ii) other amounts due under the plan from the employer that have not been remitted to the pension fund

are kept separate and apart from the employer's own money, and shall be considered to hold the amounts referred to in paragraphs (a) to (c) in trust for members, former members, and other persons with an entitlement under the plan.

(2) In the event of a liquidation, assignment or bankruptcy of an employer, an amount equal to the amount that under section (1) is considered to be held in trust shall be considered to be separate from and form no part of the estate in liquidation, assignment or bankruptcy, whether or not that amount has in fact been kept

separate and apart from the employer's own money or from the assets of the estate.

- (3) Where a pension plan is <u>terminated in whole or in part</u>, an employer who is required to pay contributions to the pension fund shall hold in trust for the member or former member or other person with an entitlement under the plan an amount of money equal to employer contributions due under the plan to the date of termination.
- (4) An administrator of a pension plan has a lien and charge on the assets of the employer in an amount equal to the amount required under subsections (1) and (3).

Funding

35. (1) A pension plan shall provide for funding, in accordance with the requirements for solvency as prescribed by the regulations, which is adequate to provide for payment of all pension benefits required to be paid under the plan.

PART VIII Termination, Wind-Up and Disposal of Business

Plan Termination

- 59. (1) The superintendent may declare the whole or part of a pension plan terminated where
 - (a) there is a suspension or cessation of employer contributions in respect of all or part of the plan membership, except where surplus is used to meet funding requirements;
 - (b) the employer has discontinued or is in the process of discontinuing all of its business operation or a part in which a substantial portion of its employees who are members of the plan are employed;
 - (c) the employer is **bankrupt within the meaning of the Bankruptcy Act** (Canada);
 - (d) the superintendent is of the opinion that the plan has failed to meet the requirements prescribed by the regulations for solvency in respect of funding; or

- (e) all or part of the business assets of a predecessor employer's business are sold, assigned or otherwise disposed of and the successor employer who acquired the business or assets does not provide a pension plan for the members of the predecessor employer's plan who become employees of the successor employer.
- (2) A declaration made under subsection (1) shall declare the whole or part of a pension plan to be terminated as of a date determined by the superintendent.

Plan termination requirements

- 60. (1) An employer, or, in the case of a multi-employer pension plan, the administrator, who intends to terminate the whole or part of a pension plan shall notify in writing the superintendent and any other person or body who is affected of that intention at least 60 days before the date of the intended termination.
 - (2) On the termination of the whole or part of a pension plan, the administrator of the plan shall file with the superintendent
 - (a) a report required by the superintendent, within 6 months after the effective date of termination; and
 - (b) all outstanding annual information returns up to the effective date of the termination, within 3 months after that date.
 - (3) The wind-up of a pension plan shall commence immediately after the termination of the plan unless the superintendent gives written approval to postpone the wind-up.

Termination payments

- 61. (1) On termination of a pension plan, the employer shall pay into the pension fund all amounts that would otherwise have been required to be paid to meet the requirements prescribed by the regulations for solvency, including
 - (a) an amount equal to the aggregate of
 - (i) the normal actuarial cost, and
 - (ii) special payments prescribed by the regulation,

that have accrued to the date of termination; and

- (b) all
- (i) amounts deducted by the employer from members' remuneration, and
- (ii) other amounts due to the pension fund from the employer

that have not been remitted to the pension fund at the date of termination.

(2)Where, on the termination, after April 1, 2008, of a pension plan, other than a multi-employer pension plan, the assets in the pension plan are less than the value of the benefits provided under the plan, the employer shall, as prescribed by the regulations, make the payments into the pension fund, in addition to the payments required under subsection (1), that are necessary to fund the benefits provided under the plan.

[emphasis added]

9. The following provisions of the *Pension Benefits Act Regulations*, NLR 114/96 (the "Regulations") deal with termination payments under section 61 of the PBA:

Payments upon plan termination

25. Where an employer is required or liable to make payments into a pension fund in accordance with subsection 61(1) of the Act, the employer shall make those payments within 30 days of the date of termination of the plan.

Payments upon plan termination to fund benefits

- 25.1 (1) The amount required to be paid under subsection 61(2) of the Act shall be divided into equal payments that are calculated over a period of not more than 5 years commencing from the date of termination of the pension plan
 - (2) Payments shall be made at least quarterly, with interest at the solvency valuation rate, commencing from the date of termination of the pension plan.
 - (3) Notwithstanding subsection (2), the first payment is due no later than 2 weeks following the date that the report required by the superintendent under subsection 60(2) of the Act is filed by the administrator of the pension plan.

- (4) Notwithstanding subsections (2) and (3), where the report required by the superintendent under subsection 60(2) of the Act is filed by the administrator of the pension plan no later than 6 months after the date of termination of the pension plan, the payment for the quarter in which the report is filed and earlier quarters is due no later than 2 weeks following the date that the report is filed.
- (5) An administrator of a pension plan shall continue to file annual information returns and actuarial valuation reports as required under the Act <u>until the amount under subsection (1) has been paid in full.</u>

[emphasis added]

- 10. Reference should also be made to section 8 of the Regulations, which sets out the time for remitting all contributions to the pension fund for the purpose of section 30 of the PBA, and to section 12 of the Regulations, which stipulates the time for payments to a pension plan for the purpose of sections 30 and 35 of the *PBA*. These provisions are separate from and distinct from the requirements under sections 25 and 25.1 of the Regulations.
- 11. With respect to the second issue, the following provisions of the *PBA* are relevant:

Definitions

- 2. In this Act
 - (j) "designated province" means a province that is a province prescribed by the regulations in which there is in force legislation substantially similar to this Act;
 - (l) "employee" means a person who performs service for an <u>employer in</u> <u>the province</u> or in an designated province and is in receipt of or entitled to remuneration for the service;
 - (m) "employer" in relation to an employee, means the person or organization whether incorporated or unincorporated, carrying on business or established <u>in the province</u>, from whom the employee receives remunerations, and includes the successors or assigns of the person or organization;

- (v.1) "multi-jurisdictional pension plan" means a pension plan that is subject to this Act and to the pension benefits legislation of one or more designated provinces or of Canada;
- (v.2) "multilateral agreement" means an agreement entered into under section 8.2;
- (ee) <u>"province of employment" means the province where an</u> <u>employee reports for work</u>, but if the employee is not required to report for work, the province where an employer's establishment is located from which an employee's remuneration is paid;

Application of Act

5. This Act applies to all pension plans for persons employed in the province, except those pension plans to which an Act of the Parliament of Canada applies.

Agreements

8. (1) The minister may

- (a) subject to the *Executive Council Act*, enter into agreements;
- (b) authorize the Canadian association of pension supervisory authorities to exercise or perform **powers and functions** of the superintendent;
- (c) delegate to a pension supervisory authority or the government of a designated province or of Canada, **powers and functions** under this Act; and
- (d) authorize the superintendent to accept delegation of powers and functions from a pension supervisory authority or the government of a designated province or of Canada.
- (2) The minister may, subject to the approval of the Lieutenant Governor in Council, enter into an agreement with the government of a designated

province or of Canada, or with more than one of them, to provide that where a pension plan is subject to both this Act and an Act of one or more of those other jurisdictions, either

- (a) this Act or a part of it is not to apply and the legislation of the other jurisdiction is to apply to the plan; or
- (b) this Act or a part of it is to apply and the legislation or part of the legislation of the other jurisdiction is not to apply to the plan,

and to establish conditions for the application of <u>the laws</u> referred to in paragraphs (a) and (b).

- 8.2 (1) The minister may, subject to the approval of the Lieutenant-Governor in Council, enter into a multilateral agreement respecting multijurisdictional pension plans with the government of a designated province or of Canada, or with more than one of them.
 - (2) A multilateral agreement may provide for
 - (a) the application of this Act and the regulations to multijurisdictional pension plans;
 - (b) the application of the pension benefits legislation of a designated province or of Canada to multi-jurisdictional pension plans;
 - (c) the application of the multilateral agreement itself to multijurisdictional pension plans; and
 - (d) the supervision and regulation of multi-jurisdictional pension plans.

[emphasis added]

12. Section 40 of the Regulations sets out the "designated provinces" within the meaning of the *PBA*, stating as follows:

- 40. The following provinces and territories of Canada are designated as provinces or territories in which there is in force legislation substantially similar to the Act:
 - (a) the Province of Alberta;
 - (b) the Province of British Columbia;
 - (c) the Province of Manitoba;
 - (d) the Province of New Brunswick;
 - (e) the Northwest Territories:
 - (f) the Province of Nova Scotia;
 - (g) the Province of Ontario;
 - (h) the Province of Quebec;
 - (i) the Province of Saskatchewan; and
 - (j) the Yukon Territory

III: Principles of Statutory Interpretation

13. In *Rizzo & Rizzo Shoes Ltd. (Re)*, [1998] 1 S.C.R. 27, at para. 21, the Supreme Court of Canada approved of and adopted the following approach to statutory interpretation:

Today there is only one principle or approach, namely, the words of an Act are to be read in their entire context and in their grammatical and ordinary sense harmoniously with the scheme of the Act, the object of the Act, and the intention of Parliament.

Rizzo Shoes, Book of Authorities of the Superintendent of Pensions, Tab 11.

- 14. This approach is consistent with and mirrored in section 16 of the Interpretation Act, RSNL 1990, c. I-19, which states as follows:
 - 16. Every Act and every regulation and every provision of an Act or regulation shall be considered remedial and shall receive the liberal construction and interpretation that best ensures the attainment of the objects of the Act, regulation, or provision according to its true meaning.
- 15. It is a well-established principle of statutory interpretation that the Legislature does not intend to produce absurd consequences. This principle was explained as follows in *Rizzo Shoes* at para. 27:

In my opinion, the consequences or effects which result from the Court of Appeal's interpretation of ss. 40 and 40a of the ESA are incompatible with both the object of the Act and with the object of the termination and severance pay provisions themselves. It is a well established principle of statutory interpretation that the legislature does not intend to produce absurd consequences. According to Côté, supra, an interpretation can be considered absurd if it leads to ridiculous or frivolous consequences, if it is extremely unreasonable or inequitable, if it is illogical or incoherent, or if it is incompatible with other provisions or with the object of the legislative enactment (at pp. 378-80). Sullivan echoes these comments noting that a label of absurdity can be attached to interpretations which defeat the purpose of a statute or render some aspect of it pointless or futile (Sullivan, Construction of Statutes, supra, at p. 88).

16. Legislation that provides minimum benefits and standards to protect the interests of employees can be characterized as benefits-conferring legislation, and such legislation "ought to be interpreted in a broad and generous manner": *Rizzo Shoes*, para. 36. Furthermore: "Any doubt arising from difficulties of language should be resolved in favour of the claimant": *Rizzo Shoes*, para. 36.

IV: Application to the PBA

- ISSUE 1: Do the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established in s. 32 of the Newfoundland and Labrador *Pension Benefits Act*, 1997, SNL 1996, c. P-4.01 ("*PBA*") include the termination payment required under s. 61(2)?
- 17. As stated above, Morneau Shepell agrees with and adopts the submissions of the Superintendent of Pensions on the scope of the deemed trusts and the lien and charge in s. 32 of the *PBA*. The following are intended as additional comments.
- 18. Morneau Shepell submits that, when sections 32 and 61 of the *PBA* are read in their entire context and in their grammatical and ordinary sense, harmoniously with the scheme of the Act, the remedial object of the Act, and the intention of the Legislature, and when it is given the broad and generous interpretation that is required of benefits-conferring legislation, the

conclusion must be that the deemed trust under s. 32(2) includes the termination payment required under s. 61(2).

- 19. The purpose of the *PBA* is to establish minimum standards for all pension plans to which it applies in order to benefit and protect the interests of plan members and other beneficiaries. This purpose was confirmed by the Supreme Court of Canada commenting on the purpose of similar legislation in Ontario in *Monsanto Canada Inc. v. Ontario (Superintendent of Financial Services)*, [2004] 3 S.C.R. 152 at para. 13:
 - The purpose of the Act was well stated in GenCorp Canada Inc. v. Ontario (Superintendent, Pensions) (1998), 1998 CanLII 2947 (ON CA), 158 D.L.R. (4th) 497 (Ont. C.A.), at p. 503:

[T]he Pension Benefits Act is clearly public policy legislation establishing a carefully calibrated legislative and regulatory scheme prescribing minimum standards for all pension plans in Ontario. It is intended to benefit and protect the interests of members and former members of pension plans, and "evinces a special solicitude for employees affected by plant closures". ...

[emphasis added]

Monsanto, Book of Authorities of the Superintendent of Pensions, Tab 8.

- 20. The *PBA*, then, is broadly premised on the need to protect employees and other beneficiaries, by protecting the pension promise through strict funding requirements.
- 21. The purpose of the deemed trusts established by the Ontario *Pension Benefits Act* was noted by the majority decision on the issue of scope of the deemed trust in *Sun Indalex Finance*, *LLC v. United Steelworkers*, [2013] 1 S.C.R. 271. The same purpose extends to deemed trusts and the lien and charge in the *PBA* (and in particular the deemed trust under section 32(2) that is triggered by an employer liquidation, assignment or bankruptcy). In *Sun Indalex*, the following purpose was identified at para. 44:
 - ... The deemed trust provision is a remedial one. Its purpose is to protect the interests of plan members. This purpose militates against adopting the limited scope proposed by Indalex and some of the intervenors. ... In the case of competing priorities between creditors, the remedial purpose favours an approach

that includes all wind-up payments in the value of the deemed trust in order to achieve a broad protection.

Sun Indalex, Book of Authorities of the Superintendent of Pensions, Tab 14.

- 22. Morneau Shepell submits that the *PBA* is benefits conferring legislation. As such, it should be given a broad and generous interpretation, and any doubt as to meaning should be resolved in favour of pension plan members and beneficiaries.
- 23. The deemed trust established under ss. 32(2) is triggered by a "liquidation, assignment or bankruptcy of an employer". These are situations in which the employer is in financial difficulty, likely putting at risk the required contributions to a pension plan. In turn, the Legislature has responded to the need to protect such contributions with a strong and clear deemed trust over all amounts specified in ss. 32(1). The amounts specified in ss. 32(1) will continue to accrue after ss. 32(2) is triggered until such time as a plan is terminated.
- 24. As an aside, the triggering events of "liquidation, assignment or bankruptcy of the employer" are not defined in the *PBA*. The Monitor asserts that the terms "assignment" and "bankruptcy" are clear, suggesting that they have the same meaning as in the *Bankruptcy and Insolvency Act*. While the meaning of these terms is not at issue on this reference, the difference between s. 32(2) and s. 59(1)(c) should be noted. The latter refers to an employer that is "bankrupt within the meaning of the *Bankruptcy Act* (Canada)". In addition, the *PBA* is concerned about "employers" as opposed to individuals or companies under the *BIA*.
- 25. Subsection 32(1)(c)(ii), which forms part of the deemed trust under subsection 32(2), refers to "all other amounts due under the plan from the employer that have not been remitted to the pension fund".
- 26. As stated by the Superintendent of Pensions in his submissions, the application of the principles of interpretation leads to the conclusion that the termination payment under ss. 61(2) of the PBA is "due" on the effective date of the termination of a pension plan and thus forms part of the deemed trust under ss. 32(2).

- 27. Section 25.1 of the Regulations requires the payment under ss. 61(2) to be divided into equal payments that are calculated over a period of "not more than 5 years commencing from the date of termination of the pension plan." This effectively permits the amortization of the payment under ss. 61(2) over a period of up to 5 years. This does not, however, mean that the payment can be amortized in all cases and is "due" on a quarterly basis for a period of 5 years.
- 28. It should be remembered that ss. 61(2) applies on the termination of a pension plan for any reason and whether by order of the Superintendent or by decision of the employer. Thus, for example, it applies when an employer continues its business but decides to terminate its pension plan, and where an employer decides to close and wind-up its business even though it is not insolvent.
- 29. The only reference to amount being "due" under s. 25.1 of the Regulations is to the first payment. The Regulations do not prescribe the number of equal payments. They do not prescribe an amortization period of 5 years in all cases.
- 30. To find, as the Monitor asserts, that the payment required under ss. 61(2) is "due" on a quarterly basis for a period of 5 years would undermine the purpose of ss. 61(2) and ss. 32(2), as well as the objects of the PBA. In turn, this would be an absurd interpretation.
- 31. For example, an employer that is not insolvent but decides to close and wind up its business would be able to avoid paying the amount owing under ss. 61(2) by amortizing that amount over 5 years and wind up its affairs before the end of the 5 years. The permissible amortization period must be such that the amount will be paid.
- 32. Similarly, in the case of an insolvent employer, the amount cannot be found to be "due" on an amortized basis over a period of 5 years in the face of the possible winding up of the employer's business.
- 33. It cannot have been intended that the amortization period permitted in s. 25.1 of the Regulations would undermine ss. 61(2) of the PBA.
- 34. Again, when sections 32 and 61 of the *PBA* are read in their entire context and in their grammatical and ordinary sense, harmoniously with the scheme of the Act, the remedial object of

the Act, and the intention of the Legislature, and when it is given the broad and generous interpretation that is required of benefits-conferring legislation, the conclusion must be that the deemed trust under s. 32(2) includes the termination payment required under s. 61(2).

- Issue 2: Do the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established in s. 32 of the *PBA* (in the absence of an agreement entered into under the *PBA* to such effect) apply to pension plan members who are or were employed in another jurisdiction in this case, in Quebec or on works declared by an act of Parliament to be for the general advantage of Canada?
- 35. As stated above, Morneau Shepell agrees with and adopts the submissions of the Superintendent of Pensions, the Attorney General of Canada and OSFI, and Retraite Québec (the "regulators") on this issue. Specifically, Morneau Shepell agrees that, as a matter of statutory interpretation and the intention of the Legislature, the deemed trusts and the lien and charge established in s. 32 of the *PBA* apply only to employment within the legislative jurisdiction of the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador.
- 36. Parliament has exclusive jurisdiction to make laws regarding federal works and undertakings, including laws regarding working conditions such as pensions: *Bell Canada v. Quebec (CSST)*, [1988] 1 S.C.R. 749, Book of Authorities of the Attorney General of Canada, Tab 4.
- 37. Morneau Shepell submits that it was not the intention of the Legislature of the Province of Newfounland and Labrador to extend the PBA to the exclusive jurisdiction of Parliament. This is a matter of statutory interpretation. The language of the PBA makes it clear that the Legislature intended the PBA to apply only to employment in the Province over which the Legislature has constitutional jurisdiction, subject to such agreements as may be entered into under the terms of the PBA.

All of which is respectfully submitted.

Dated at Halifax, Nova Scotia this 23rd day of August, 2017.

Ronald A. Pink, Q.C. Bettina Quistgaard

Pink Larkin

Counsel for Morneau Shepell in its capacity as Replacement Pension Plan Administrator